



# **Local Moon Sighting V/S Universal Moon Sighting (END OF DEBATE) -**

**Evidence From Sahih Hadith & Statements Of Scholars & Muhaddiseen**

## Local Moon Sighting V/S Universal Moon Sighting (END OF DEBATE) - Evidence From Sahih Hadith & Statements Of Scholars & Muhaddiseen

The below article is compiled with clear evidences from clear Hadiths and sound Hikma. May Allaah reward the brother who put the compilation together.

Some people follows the opinion of wahdatul matale (unification of the horizon), "Global Moonsighting", so if the moon is visually sighted anywhere in the world then they start fasting and celebrate EID etc.

### FIRSTLY :

A narration of Ibn ‘Abbas in Sahīh Muslim indicates that local moonsighting alone was the prevailing method in the time of the Blessed Prophet (صلى الله عليه وسلم) and was a part of the

teachings of the Blessed Prophet (صلى الله عليه وسلم) to the Sahābah. The narration goes like this:

Sahīh Muslim Book 6 Chapter 5: THERE IS A SIGHTING OF THE MOON FOR EVERY TOWN THE SIGHTING AT ONE TOWN CANNOT BE HELD VALID FOR THE OTHER TOWN SITUATED AT A CONSIDERABLE DISTANCE FROM IT

Kurayb narrates that Umm al-Fadl sent him to Mu‘āwiyah in Sham for something. Kurayb says: "I went to Sham and finished the job. I was in Sham when the month of Ramadān began and we saw the moon the night of Friday. When I reached Madinah at the end of the blessed month, Ibn ‘Abbas asked me about Sham. (After answering him) He then asked me when we saw the moon. I said: 'We saw the moon the night of Jumu‘ah.' He asked, 'Did you see it as well?' I said: 'Yes, I saw it too and many others saw it

and we all kept fasting and so did Mu‘āwiyah (that is according to that moonsighting).'

Ibn Abbas said: 'But we saw the moon on Saturday night, therefore, we will keep fasting for thirty days according to that unless we sight the moon on the 29th' I asked: 'You don't think the moonsighting of Mu‘āwiyah and his fasting is enough for you?'

Ibn Abbas replied: 'No, this is how the Blessed Prophet (صلى الله عليه وسلم) taught us"' (Muslim H.1819, Tirmidhī H.629, Nasa'i H.2084, Abu-Dawud H.1985, Musnad Ahmad H.2653 Dar-qutni H.2234)

This hadith is clear evidence. When Ibn Abbas was informed by the person who himself sighted the moon that the people of Sham had begun Ramadan one day before, he responded that it was not only his opinion, but also the teachings of the Blessed Prophet (صلى الله عليه وسلم) that the

moonsighting of another locality was not compulsory upon them.

Islam and its Shariah does not change with time

### SECONDLY:

Shaykh Uthaymeen has issued a very clear fatwa to Muslims in the Americas and other lands outside the Arabian Peninsula with no ambiguity whatsoever regarding this matter:

It is well known amongst astronomers that the time the moon rises differs from place to place. The moon might be seen in one place and not in another. Therefore, according to the verse, whoever does not see it is not obliged to fast. . . . If, therefore, each place has its own ruling due to the variation in the time that the sun rises and sets, the same also applies due to the variation in

the time that the moon rises and sets. . .  
.Therefore, the answer to the question is clear. It  
is obligatory for you to follow the sighting of  
the new moon in the place where you  
are [Shaykh Ibn Uthaymīn....al-Aqalliyāt al-  
Muslimah - Page 84, Fatwa No.23]

### LOGICALLY:

You will not find a single hadith that tells about  
one country following the sighting of another  
country (like the Arabs of the Arabian  
peninsula).THERE IS NO SUCH HADITH,  
because no one could travel great distances or  
use telephones and satellites to report such  
sightings until about 50 years ago, if even that  
early. On the contrary, we find that Muslims  
living much closer to one another with different  
sightings never bothering to follow one  
another.Evidence: the Hadith of Ibn Abbas in  
Sahīh Muslim

Even in the case of 'Īd-ul-Adhā, there is no evidence from the Qur'an or sunnah that the Messenger of Allāh (صلى الله عليه وسلم) or any of the Sahābah ever tried to establish a so-called "Wahdatul Matale' (unification of the horizon):

"If, as we are told by those postulating the 'Day after Arafat' position, that 'Īd-ul-Adhā is dependent on the Hajj date, then why did the Prophet (صلى الله عليه وسلم) make no effort to ascertain the Hajj dates in Makkah for his 'Īd celebration in Madinah? After the conquest of Makkah in the seventh year of the Hijra there would have been no problem in finding out when the Hajj was going to be since there would be ten days for a rider to travel to surrounding areas with the glorious news. The Messenger of Allāh (صلى الله عليه وسلم) made no attempt to know, or to inform the Muslims in the areas around Madinah about when the Hajj was in Makkah. Every Muslim community prayed according to its own sighting of the crescent of



Ḍūl Hijjah. Accordingly, all the scholars of Islām are unanimous that ‘Īd-ul-Adhā is on the 10th of Ḍūl Hijjah which is determined by the sighting in each locality, and NOT ON THE 10th OF ḌŪL HIJJAḤ IN MAKKAH. It is a bid‘ah to try to impose a Vatican-like dogma on the Muslim ummah, although the propagators would tell you that they are simply following a 'universal horizon.' Don't be fooled. In Ramadān of 1999 it was claimed that the moon was seen in Yemen and Libya, and the Muslims of those countries began fasting on December 8, 1999.

Those who claim to accept any sighting anywhere in the world conveniently ignored those Muslims, opting for the 'universal sighting' of their choice. The Companions of the Prophet (صلى الله عليه وسلم) opposed every attempt to impose the moon sighting in one town over the others, even in close proximity, when it was not seen on a clear horizon, or when the horizon was cloudy on the 29 day of the Islamic month." (The Community News, a newsletter published by TARIC, vol. 107, March 8, 2000.)



To call people to follow a "global sighting" is to defy the laws of Allāh. Just as He has ordained for us to pray five times a day at times according to the position of the sun relative to our own horizon where we happen to be at that time, so has He ordained for us to look for the hilāl and sight it where we happen to be living or staying during that time of the month. To say there is one universal horizon, or a "unity" of the horizon is absolutely absurd. It would be the same as arguing that we should follow the prayer timings of Masjid Al-ḥarām for the sake of unity. To call people to pray in perfect global synchronization with Makkah would be a profound bid‘ah, just as it is to call people to the falsehood of "one horizon," would be to ignore that the planet earth is round.

**MORE LOGIC:** (For those who likes to present logic and disregard clear apparent Hadith)

"North America lags the rest of the world in

time (they are 10 hours behind South Africa), quite often they will see the new moon before the rest of the world, and thus start the new month ahead of the rest of the world. This is a consequence of the fact that the sun sets last over the American continent, giving the new moon more time to age and become visible."

So, this is why global sighting is wrong, why it was never implemented by anyone until less than 50 years ago: Allāh has made it impossible to implement!

Proof: If a new moon (not a hilāl, but an "invisible" moon) has been born and only develops into a mature visible hilāl by 20 minutes after sunset in Honolulu, Hawaii, which would mark the beginning of Ramadān for them, what are the Saudis, Kuwaitis, and Bahrainis going to do about their fasting? It's 18:30 at night in Honolulu and by the time they got to a phone and called anyone in Saudia it

was 19:00, that's 07:00 in the morning, the next day in Saudi Arabia. Too late to get on Saudi TV 1 to announce the beginning of Ramadān. Oops! They also missed out on the first night of praying tarawīḥ! For Manila in the Philippines and many places in Australia, their Muslims will have no chance whatsoever of starting Ramadān on time since it is already 12:30 in the afternoon (or later in some Australian time zones) the NEXT DAY! How can someone say that Allāh (سبحانه وتعالى) would prefer this type of unfairness to be imposed on His slaves just west of the International Dateline?

From this proof, we see there is no ḥikmah whatsoever in the so-called "global" moonsighting (wahdat-ul-matale'). Please note that this proof is completely devoid of "calculations" or the use of star charts. This is just plain common sense that shows how ridiculous "global" sighting really is. With local sighting, Muslims are not following any ethnic group, tribe, political affiliation, or

regime/government. No one feels slighted. No nation/state is preferred over another. That's the Islamic way: the fair way, the just way, the way that Allāh (سبحانه وتعالى) commands us to follow, and the way His Messenger (صلى الله عليه وسلم) taught Ibn 'Abbas (remember the Kurayb Hadith?).

fatwaa from any of the four great Imams supporting "global" moonsighting (wahdat-ul-matale') can never be applied to this current bid'ah simply because none of them lived during a time when travel across thousands of kilometers could be achieved in the same day, nor could they speak with someone sitting on the other side of the planet over a telephone to inquire about hilāl sightings.

There is no evidence from the Qur'an or the sunnah, supporting a so-called "global" moonsighting (wahdat-ul-matale') that relies on

sighting attempts from observation points spanning thousands of kilometers around the globe. Even with all the technological advancements today, according to the sharī‘ah or technologically or logically impossible to implement. Regarding the fasting of Ramadān, a proof is given (in above paragraph) that it is impossible to implement this so-called "global" moonsighting (wahdat-ul-matale') logically or according to the sharī‘ah.

Via : Brother Gazi Arman Rahman

The Texts of the Qur’aan and Sunnah make the actual sighting of the new moon the signal for the Muslims to start fasting Ramadaan; they stop fasting when they see the new moon of Shawwaal; the dates of Eid al-Adhaa and Yawm ‘Arafaat are similarly determined. Allaah says (interpretation of the meanings):

“... So whoever among you sights (the crescent on the first night of) the month (of Ramadaan), he must observe sawm (fast) that month...” [al-Baqarah 2:185]

“They ask you (O Muhammad) about the new moons. Say: these are signs to mark fixed periods of time for mankind and for the pilgrimage...” [al-Baqarah 2:189]

The Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said: “Fast when you see it [the new moon] and stop fasting when you see it, and if it is cloudy then complete the month with thirty days.”

[Reported by Al-Bukhâri, chapter of “Fasting” (hadith 1909) and by Muslim, chapter of “Fasting” (hadith 2568), from the hadith of Abu Hurayra رضي الله عنه.]

The Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) made the beginning of the fast

conditional upon the confirmed sighting of the new moon of Ramadaan, and the ending of the fast conditional upon the confirmed sighting of the new moon of Shawwaal; he did not connect this to calculations of the movements of stars or other heavenly bodies. This is how it was done at the time of the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him), during the rule of the Khulafa' al-Raashidoon, at the time of the four imaams, and during the three centuries which the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said were the best. Referring to calculations of the lunar months to start and end periods of worship, instead of actually sighting the new moon, is a bid'ah (reprehensible innovation) that has no good in it and has no basis in sharee'ah. The best of all is to follow the salaf in religious matters, and the worst of all is to follow newly-invented innovations in religion. May Allaah protect us and you and all the Muslims from tribulation, both obvious and hidden.



## **Statement of Muhadditheen and Scholars Regarding Moon sighting :**

The Goal of Shareeah is Unity  
Tafarruq (splitting-up) in the Religion is more  
evil than having ikhtilaaf (differences) in some  
opinions as pointed out in this beautiful article  
by Shaik Albani(Rah)

It has been the consensus of Muslim scholars  
from the first generation until today that Eid  
would be on Local Moon Sighting and NOT on  
Astronomical calculations, Global Moon  
Sighting or Saudi Moon Sighting.

Saudi and All Gulf countries celebrate EID  
according to Local Moon sighting and NOT on  
any other Methodologies. Unless it is agreed  
upon on all Ulema and all people, it is  
obligatory upon him to be in agreement with the

people, and that the ruling of the people - concerning the Prayer, breaking the fast, and sacrificing.

So here is what Scholars say about Moon sighting:

Statement of muhadditheen:

This hadeeth and the titles given by the muhadditheen, is more than merely a proof. It is a decisive sword

### 1. Imam Muslim (rah):

Each land has its own sighting of the moon, and if they see the crescent in one land, that does not necessarily apply to regions that are far away from it [Sahih Muslim 1087]

باب بَيَانِ أَنَّ لِكُلِّ بَلَدٍ رُؤْيَتَهُمْ وَأَنَّهُمْ إِذَا رَأَوْا الْهَيْلَالَ بِبَلَدٍ لَا يَثْبُتُ حُكْمُهُ لِمَا بَعْدَ عَنْهُمْ

### 2. Imam Tirmidhi(rah)

What Has Been Related About: For The People  
OF Every Land There Is A Sighting [Jami`at-  
Tirmidhi 693]

باب مَا جَاءَ لِكُلِّ أَهْلِ بَلَدٍ رُؤْيُهُمْ

### 3. Imam Abu Dawood (rah):

When The Crescent Is Sighted In A Land A  
Night Before It Is Sighted In Other Lands

[Sunan Abi Dawud 2332]

باب إِذَا رُؤِيَ الْهَلَالُ فِي بَلَدٍ قَبْلَ الْآخَرِينَ بِلَيْلَةٍ

### 4. Imam Nasaee(rah):

The People Of Different Lands Differing In  
Sighting (The Moon) [Sunan an-Nasa'i 2111]

باب اخْتِلَافِ أَهْلِ الْآفَاقِ فِي الرُّؤْيَةِ

Kuraib reported that Umm Fadl, daughter of Harith, sent him (Fadl, i.e. her son) to Mu'awiya in Syria. I (Fadl) arrived in Syria, and did the needful for her. It was there in Syria that the month of Ramadan commenced. I saw the new moon (of Ramadan) on Friday. I then came back to Medina at the end of the month. Abdullah b.

'Abbas (Allah be pleased with him) asked me (about the new moon of Ramadan) and said: When did you see it? I said: We saw it on the night of Friday. He said: (Did) you see it yourself? I said: Yes, and the people also saw it and they fasted and Mu'awiya also fasted, whereupon he said: But we saw it on Saturday night. So we will continue to fast till we complete thirty (fasts) or we see it (the new moon of Shawwal). I said: Is the sighting of the moon by Mu'awiya not valid for you? He said: No; this is how the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) has commanded us. Yahya b. Yahya was in doubt (whether the word used in the narration by Kuraib) was Naktafi or Taktafi.

حَدَّثَنَا يَحْيَى بْنُ يَحْيَى، وَيَحْيَى بْنُ أَبِي ثَوْبٍ، وَقُتَيْبَةُ، وَابْنُ، حُجْرٍ -  
-، قَالَ يَحْيَى بْنُ يَحْيَى أَخْبَرَنَا وَقَالَ الْآخَرُونَ، حَدَّثَنَا إِسْمَاعِيلُ  
وَهُوَ ابْنُ جَعْفَرٍ - عَنْ مُحَمَّدٍ، - وَهُوَ ابْنُ أَبِي حَرْمَلَةَ - عَنْ  
كُرَيْبٍ، أَنَّ أُمَّ الْفَضْلِ بِنْتَ الْحَارِثِ، بَعَثَتْهُ إِلَى مُعَاوِيَةَ  
بِالشَّامِ قَالَ فَقَدِمْتُ الشَّامَ فَقَضَيْتُ حَاجَتَهَا وَاسْتُهِلَّ عَلَى  
رَمَضَانَ وَأَنَا بِالشَّامِ فَرَأَيْتُ الْهَالَ لَيْلَةَ الْجُمُعَةِ ثُمَّ قَدِمْتُ  
الْمَدِينَةَ فِي آخِرِ الشَّهْرِ فَسَأَلَنِي عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ عَبَّاسٍ - رَضِيَ اللَّهُ

عنهما - ثُمَّ ذَكَرَ الْهَلَالَ فَقَالَ مَتَى رَأَيْتُمُ الْهَلَالَ فَقُلْتُ رَأَيْنَاهُ لَيْلَةَ الْجُمُعَةِ . فَقَالَ أَنْتَ رَأَيْتَهُ فَقُلْتُ نَعَمْ وَرَأَاهُ النَّاسُ وَصَامُوا وَصَامَ مُعَاوِيَةُ . فَقَالَ لَكِنَّا رَأَيْنَاهُ لَيْلَةَ السَّبْتِ فَلَا نَزَالَ نَصُومُ حَتَّى نَكْمِلَ ثَلَاثِينَ أَوْ نَرَاهُ . فَقُلْتُ أَوْ لَا تَكْتَفِي بِرُؤْيَا مُعَاوِيَةَ وَصِيَامِهِ فَقَالَ لَا هَكَذَا أَمَرَنَا رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ . وَشَكََّ يَحْيَى بْنُ يَحْيَى فِي نَكْتَفِي أَوْ تَكْتَفِي .

## Statements of Leading Salafi Scholars :

### 1. Sheik Albane (Rah ):

Abu Hurairah narrated that : the Prophet (ﷺ) said: "The fast is the day the people fast, the breaking of the fast is the day the people break their fast, and the sacrifice is the day the people sacrifice."

أَخْبَرَنِي مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ إِسْمَاعِيلَ، حَدَّثَنَا إِبْرَاهِيمُ بْنُ الْمُنْذِرِ، حَدَّثَنَا إِسْحَاقُ بْنُ جَعْفَرِ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ، حَدَّثَنِي عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ جَعْفَرٍ، عَنْ عُثْمَانَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ الْأَخْنَسِيِّ، عَنْ سَعِيدِ الْمَقْبُرِيِّ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَالَ " الصَّوْمُ يَوْمَ تَصُومُونَ وَالْفِطْرُ يَوْمَ تُفْطِرُونَ

وَالْأَضْحَى يَوْمَ تُضَحُّونَ " . قَالَ أَبُو عِيسَى هَذَا حَدِيثٌ  
حَسَنٌ غَرِيبٌ . وَفَسَّرَ بَعْضُ أَهْلِ الْعِلْمِ هَذَا الْحَدِيثَ فَقَالَ إِنَّمَا  
مَعْنَى هَذَا أَنَّ الصَّوْمَ وَالْفِطْرَ مَعَ الْجَمَاعَةِ وَعُظُمَ  
النَّاسِ

[Jami` at-Tirmidhi 697]

Al-Bayhaquee relates by way of Abu Haneefah, who said: ‘Alee ibn al-Aqmar related to me, from Masrooq, who said: I entered upon ‘Aaishah on the day of ‘Arafah, so she said: “Serve Masrooq with some gruel, and make it more sweet.” Masrooq said: Nothing prevented me from fasting this day except that I feared that it may be the day of Sacrifice. So ‘Aa’ishah said to me: “The day of Sacrifice is when the people sacrifice, and the day of ending the fast is when the people end their fast.” This chain of narration is jayyid (good) due to what has preceded.

Understanding This Hadeeth:  
Imaam at-Tirmidhee says after quoting the

hadeeth: “One of the people of knowledge has explained this hadeeth by saying: Its meaning is to fast and end the fast along with the Jamaa’ah and the majority of people.”

**As-San’aanee said in Sublus-Salaam (2/72):**

“In this (hadeeth) is a proof that being in agreement with the people is accepted in establishing ‘Eed, and that the individual person who believes that it is the day of ‘Eed – because of the sighting of the moon – then it is obligatory upon him to be in agreement with the people, and that the ruling of the people – concerning the Prayer, breaking the fast, and sacrificing – is binding upon the individual.”

**2. Ibn al-Qayyim (rahimahullaah)** mentioned this meaning in Tahdheebus-Sunan (3/214), and said: “It is said: In it a refutation of those who say that whosoever knows the



positions of the moon due to astronomical calculations, then it is permissible for him to fast and end the fast, even if others do not know. It is also said: That the individual witness who sees the moon, but the qaadee (judge) has not accepted his testimony, then there is no fasting for him, just as there is no fasting for the people.”

**Abul-Hasan as-Sindee** said in Haashiyah ‘alaa Ibn Maajah, after mentioning the hadeeth of Abu Hurayrah which was related by at-Tirmidhee: “And its apparent meaning is: That there is no room for individual (opinions) to enter into these affairs, nor to act individually in this. Rather, this affair goes back to the Imaam (the Leader of the Muslims) and the Jamaa’ah (united body of Muslims under the Imaam). It is obligatory upon the individuals to follow the Imaam and the Jamaa’ah. From this is that if an individual sights the moon, but the qaadee rejects his witness, then the individual has

no right in these matters, but rather he must follow the Jamaa'ah in this.”

And this is the meaning which is evident from the hadeeth, and which is emphasized by the fact that ‘Aa’ishah (raa) used it with Masrooq when he prevented himself from fasting on the day of ‘Arafah, fearing that it could be the day of Sacrifice. So she explained to him that there is no weight given to his individual opinion in this, and that he should follow the Jamaa’ah. So she said to him: “The day of Sacrifice is when the people sacrifice, and the day of ending the fast is when the people end their fast.”

## Unity is One of the Goals of the Sharee’ah

And this is what is befitting for the easy-natured and tolerant Sharee’ah (Prescribed Islaamic Law), one of the goals of which is uniting the people together, unifying their

ranks and keeping away from them all that would split their comprehensive unity – from the individual opinions. So the Sharee’ah does not give any weight to the individual opinion in matters concerning ‘ibaadah jamaa’iyyah (collective acts of worship), such as Fasting, ‘Eed and Prayer in congregation – even if the opinion is correct, from one angle.

Do you not see that the Sahaabah (the Companions) – radiallaahu ‘anhum – used to pray behind each other. So from them were those who held the view that touching a woman, or the flowing of blood from the body invalidates the wudhoo’ (ablution), along with those who did not hold this view. From them were those who would complete the Prayer whilst traveling, whilst others shortened. Yet these, and other such differences, did not prevent them from collectively praying behind a single Imaam and deeming it to be acceptable. And this is

because they knew that tafarruq (splitting-up) in the Religion is more evil than having ikhtilaaf (differences) in some opinions. Indeed, the matter with one of them reached the extent that he would not even deem acceptable any opinion which differed with the great Imaam in the major gatherings; such as the gathering at Minaa (during Hajj), to the extent that he would totally abandon acting upon his opinion in that gathering – fleeing from that which could result from this evil, because of acting according to his own opinion.

Thus, Abu Daawood relates (1/307) that ‘Uthmaan (raa) prayed four rak’ahs at Minaa, so ‘Abdullaah ibn Mas’ood criticized him saying: “I prayed two rak’ahs with the Prophet (ﷺ) and two rak’ahs with Abu Bakr, and two rak’ahs with ‘Umar, and two rak’ahs with ‘Uthmaan in the beginning of his rule, then he completed it (i.e. by praying four rak’ahs). After that the ways

became divided with you all. So I hope from these four rak'ahs, that two of them would be accepted.” Then Ibn Mas'ood prayed four rak'ahs. So it was said to him: You criticized 'Uthmaan, yet you prayed four? So he said: “Differing is evil.”

Its chain of narration is Saheeh (authentic), and something similar to this is related in the Musnad (5/155) of Imaam Ahmad, from Abu Dharr (raa).

So those who continue splitting-up with regards to the Prayer, and who refuse to follow the local Imaams in some mosques – especially in the witr Prayer during Ramadaan – using as proof that this is against their madhhab (school of thought), then they should reflect upon the above mentioned hadeeth and athar (narration). Likewise, those who claim knowledge of astronomy and who, due to their opinion, fast and end their fast alone – preceding or

lagging behind the majority of Muslims, not seeing any problem in doing so – should also reflect upon the previously quoted proofs. So all of them should consider, and reflect upon the knowledge that has been mentioned. Perhaps they will find for themselves a cure for their ignorance and self-delusion, so that they may then become a unified rank along with their Muslim brothers – for indeed the Hand of Allaah Subhanahu wa Taa’ala is over the Jamaa’ah.

#### Footnotes:

[1] Silsilatul-Ahaadeethus-Saheehah (1/442-445), the hadeeth authentications have been abridged and edited.

Source: <http://www.hgwc.in/ramadhan-special/112-ramadan-a-reminder-of-unity-shaykh-al-albanee>

### 3. Shaikh Abdul Aziz bin Abdullah bin Baz (rah)

Question: Appearance of Ramadaan Hilaal or Shawwal Hilaal differs between Muslim countries. So should the Muslims fast if the Hilaal appears in one of those countries?

Answer:

The scholars have difference of opinion regarding the issue of Hilaal. Some of them view that if Ramadaan Hilaal appears in a place per Islamic rules, so all Muslims should start fasting. And if Shawwal Hilaal appears, all Muslims should break fast. And this is famous in the Fiqh of Imam Ahmad. And from this e.g. if we see the Hilaal in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia, then it is incumbent on all Muslims in all countries to follow this sighting for fasting in case of Ramadaan and for breaking the fast in case of Shawwal. And it was based on an open statement of Allah (SWT) in the Qur'an: Fa man shahida minkum ash-shahr fal yasumh. and the



open statement of the Hadith from our Prophet (ﷺ): if you saw it fast, and if you saw it, break the fast.

And some scholars who say that it is not necessary to fast from the appearance of Ramadaan Hilaal, nor to break fast in Shawwal, except for the one who saw the Hilaal or agreed on the sighting in the Matale of Hilaal, because Matale of Hilaal differs, as agreed by people who know.

So if there are any differences (of Matale), each country must follow their own sighting. If a country agrees in the Matale of Hilaal, it follows, otherwise not.

And this is what the Sheikhul Islam Ibn Taimiyah RHA chose. And he based this on the word of Allah (SWT): Fa man shahida minkum ash-shahr fal yasumh. and the Hadith of the prophet (ﷺ), if you saw it fast, and if you saw it, break the fast. i.e. by the same daleel / method, which was used by the ones who obligate (all to

follow one sighting), but Ibn Taimiyah who bases on the same Ayah and Hadith, differs (in his conclusions). If the ruling was to follow the witness and the sighter, so the ones who did not witnessed or saw it, the ruling will not be obligated on them. And if the Matale (sighting) differs, so the ruling of Hilaal cannot be generalized (for them).

And this is for sure a strong argument to use, based on proof (daleel) and strengthened by viewpoint and qiyas (analogy).

Source:

Chapter: Rules of starting and ending a month and the sighting of Hilaal

Book: Fatawa Islamiyah: AbdulAziz Bin Baaz, Muhammad Bin Saleh Bin Othaimeen, Abdullah Bin AbdurRahmaan AlJibreen; Darul Watan Publishers

<http://www.hilalcommittee.com/fatwas/binbazfatwa.html>

#### 4. Shaikh Saleh bin Uthaymeen (rah)

Question: Should we fast and end our fast according to the sighting of the new moon in Saudi Arabia or should we do it according to the sighting of the new moon in the country where we are?

Response: There are as many as six different opinions amongst the scholars concerning this issue. However, there are two main points of view. The first is that everyone should sight the moon in their own country and those countries where the moon rises at the same time should follow them. The reason for this is that the time at which the moon rises, varies from place to place. The second opinion is that the beginning of the new month need only be confirmed in any one of the Muslim countries. If the sighting of the new moon is confirmed in any

Muslim country, it is then obligatory for all Muslims to use that sighting to begin the fast of Ramadhaan or end it. According to this last opinion, if the new month is confirmed in Saudi Arabia it is obligatory upon all Muslims, in all parts of the world, to fast if it is the beginning of Ramadhaan and to end their fast if it is the beginning of Shawwaal. This is the most common opinion held by the followers of the madhhab of Imaam Ahmad Ibn Hanbal.

However, the first opinion is more correct because of the evidence in the Qur.aan, Sunnah and because of analogy. With regards to the Qur.aan, Allaah (Subhaanahu wa Ta'aala) says:

{The month of Ramadaan in which was revealed the Qur.aan, a guidance for mankind and clear proofs for guidance and the criterion (between right and wrong). So whoever witnesses the month should fast it...}, [Soorah al-Baqarah, Aayah 185].

This last sentence is a conditional sentence, and the ruling contained in a conditional sentence is established for whomever the condition applies to and it is annulled for anyone for whom the condition does not apply. So the sentence:

((Whoever witnesses the month should fast it)) implies that whoever does not witness it does not fast it.

It is well known amongst astronomers that the time the moon rises differs from place to place. The moon might be seen in one place and not in another. Therefore, according to the verse, whoever does not see it is not obliged to fast.

With regards to the Sunnah, the Prophet(ﷺ) said:

((If you sight it (the new moon of Ramadaan), then fast and if you sight it (the new moon of Shawaal), then end the fast.

And if it is obscured from you, then complete thirty days (of Sha'baan))).

He (sal-Allaahu `alayhe wa sallam) said: ((If you sight it)). He therefore linked the ruling to the sighting and if a ruling is linked to an effective cause, then that ruling is annulled in the absence of that cause.

With regards to analogy, we say that in as much as the times for beginning the fast and breaking the fast every day vary from place to place so, in the same way, the times for the beginning and ending of the monthly fast also vary. We here in Riyadh, for example, begin our fast every day before the people in Al-Hijaaz and we also break our fast before they do. It is, therefore, obligatory upon us to start fasting while they are still eating. On the other hand, at the end of the day we are eating while they are still fasting. If, therefore, each place has its own ruling due to the variation in the time that

the sun rises and sets, the same also applies due to the variation in the time that the moon rises and sets.

Therefore, the answer to the question is clear. It is obligatory for you to follow the sighting of the new moon in the place where you are.

Shaykh Ibn 'Uthaymeen

al-Aqalliyaat al-Muslimah - Page 84, Fatwa No.23

4 Shaikh Saleh ibn Fawzan al-Fawzan (hafidhahullah) was asked whether is it permissible to fast with the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia if one were to be living in Algeria although the days of the beginning of Ramadaan differ between in those countries, and with whom should one celebrate Eid?...

Shaikh Saleh ibn Fawzan al-Fawzan



(hafidhahullah) explained in light of the Hadeeth of Allah's Messenger (sallallahu alaihi wasallam), in the following words:

"Fast when you see it (i.e., the crescent moon of Ramadaan), and stop fasting when you see it (i.e., the crescent moon of Shawwal)." [See, Saheeh al-Bukharee (Eng.) book. 31, no. 124]

So, Allah's Messenger (sallallahu alaihi wasallam) tied the obligation of fasting with the sighting of the new moon - and this varies according to the moon-sighting (in different countries/regions)...and there is no doubt that moon-sighting in Algeria differs from moon-sighting in the Saudi.

So, every person fasts with the people of his region/country, in which he is. (and) If they see the crescent, he stops fasting with them. Your ruling is (the same as) the ruling of the Muslims, with whom you live - whichever region it be - whether; Algeria or any other - You begin your fasts with them, and you stop fasting with

them." [end quote of Shaikh Saleh ibn Fawzan  
al-Fawzaan]

<http://www.alfawzan.af.org.sa/node/7450>

Sheik Assim Al-Hakeem on Should we fast  
according to Saudi Arabia

[https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ngcx-  
ocf1ng](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ngcx-ocf1ng)

**5. Shaikh Dr Wasiullaah Mohammad Abbaas  
said in Whatsapp : "**

Those Muslim brothers who , during the months  
of Ramadhaan , Dhul Hijjah and other months  
are giving an invitation to the whole Muslims of  
the world to start fasting at the same time , it's  
my request to them to keep away from this since  
this statement ( universal moonsighting ) is an  
opinion which is less dominant and rejected in  
the sight of reliable scholars who are more pious  
( in sha' Allaah ) and god conscious than us in

the sight of Allaah .

And those people who are calling towards this ,  
**DARE NOT SCATTER** this Ummah into pieces  
which has already been devoured due to  
differences .

I fear to these people that they may raise the  
issue of universal salaah timings for the whole  
Islamic world.

The brothers of Islam who are after these rare  
issues , I tell them to **FEAR ALLAAH** .

And they should **NOT** be **STUBBORN** and go  
against those trustworthy  
Muslim scholars , whose services to the Deen ,  
sincerity , eagerness to do righteous deeds ,  
purity of intention is evident to the world .

And Allaah is the Guide to the Straight Path "

Signed

Shaikh Dr Wasiullaah Mohammad Abbaas .  
Mufti Masjide Haram, professor Ummul Qurah  
university, Makkah Mukarramah  
28 Dhul Qa'dah 1434 Hijri

Note: Verily, the Hand of Allah is with the  
Jama'ah:

فَإِنَّ يَدَ اللَّهِ عَلَى الْجَمَاعَةِ فَإِنَّ الشَّيْطَانَ مَعَ مَنْ فَارَقَ الْجَمَاعَةَ  
يَرْكُضُ

Verily, the Hand of Allah is with the Jama'ah,  
and the Shaitan is with the one who splits away  
from the Ummah, running with him.

Sunan an-Nasa'i 4020 ,Grade : Sahih  
(Darussalam)

-----

7. Shaykh Ibn ‘Uthaymeen (may Allaah have mercy on him) was asked about those who call for the ummah to be united in fasting and for the moon sighting to be based on its sighting in Makkah. He said:

This is impossible from an astronomical point of view, because the sighting of the new moon, as Shaykh al-Islam Ibn Taymiyah said, differs, according to the scientists who are well-versed in this field. Because it differs, then each country should have its own ruling, according to the reports and according to science.

The evidence from reports is the verse in which Allaah says (interpretation of the meaning):

“So whoever of you sights (the crescent on the first night of) the month (of Ramadan i.e. is present at his home), he must observe Sawm (fasts) that month”

## [al-Baqarah 2:185]

If it so happens that people in a remote region of the world do not see the new moon whereas the people of Makkah do see it, then how can the words of this verse apply to those who have not seen the new moon? The Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said: “Fast when you see it and stop fasting when you see it.” (Agreed upon). So if the people of Makkah, for example, see it, then how can we expect the people of Pakistan and countries further east to start fasting, when we know that the new moon has not yet appeared in their region, and the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) connected the start of fasting to the sighting of the moon?

The scientific evidence is the correct analogy which we cannot contradict. We know that dawn appears in eastern regions of the earth before it appears in western regions, so if dawn has appeared in eastern regions, do we have to

stop eating even though it is still night where we are? The answer is no. If the sun has set in eastern regions but it is still day where we are, is it permissible for us to break our fast? The answer is no. And the new moon is exactly like the sun, except that the timing of the new moon is monthly and the timing of the sun is daily. The One Who said (interpretation of the meaning):

“and eat and drink until the white thread (light) of dawn appears to you distinct from the black thread (darkness of night), then complete your Sawm (fast) till the nightfall”

[al-Baqarah 2:187] is also the One Who said (interpretation of the meaning):

“So whoever of you sights (the crescent on the first night of) the month (of Ramadan i.e. is present at his home), he must observe Sawm (fasts) that month”

[al-Baqarah 2:185]

So the evidence of both the texts and science indicates that we should establish a separate ruling for each place when it comes to starting and ending the fast, and this should be connected to the physical sign which Allaah has described in His Book and which His Prophet Muhammad (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) established in his Sunnah, namely the sighting of the moon and the sighting of the sun or dawn.

End quote from Fataawa Arkaan al-Islam, p. 451.

8. The Council has studied the issue of proving the new moon by means of calculation, and what has been narrated in the Qur'aan and Sunnah, and they have studied the comments of the scholars on this matter. They have decided unanimously that astronomical calculations carry no weight in determining the new moon



with regard to Islamic matters, because the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said, “Fast when you see it and stop fasting when you see it.” And he (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said: “Do not fast until you see it, and do not stop fasting until you see it.” And because of other evidence to that effect.

End quote, from Fataawa al-Lajnah al-Daa’imah, 10/102.

**Final Conclusion : Al-Ifta Permanent Committee KSA Says : If the people of your country rely on moon sighting as prescribed in sharee‘ah, then you should start and end the fast with them, and you should not differ from them and follow the moonsighting of another country, because**

**Prophet (blessings and peace of Allah be upon him) said: “The fast is the day when you fast and al-Fitr is the day when you**

**break the fast, and al-Adha is the day when you offer the sacrifice.” Narrated by al-Tirmidhi, 697, who said: some of the scholars interpreted this hadeeth as meaning that the beginning and end of the fast should be observed with the main body of Muslims and the majority of the people. The hadeeth was classed as saheeh by al-Albaani in Saheeh al-Tirmidhi.**

-----

**Urdu Video : Kya Saudi Arabia Ka Chand (Hilal) Sare Duniyah Ke Liye Hai..?? Ya Nahi..?? Shaykh Abu Zaid Zameer**

**Watch Here : <https://youtu.be/5MiFWV6n7hs>**

*The Way of Salafiyyah.Com*